

BOF Effectiveness Monitoring Committee Meeting Notes

April 25, 2018

UC Cooperative Extension Office, Mendocino County Ukiah, California

1. Participants (16): Members--Dr. Russ Henly (Co-Chair), Sue Husari (Co-Chair), Sal Chinnici, Tom Engstrom, Matt House, Clarence Hostler, Dr. Matt O'Connor, Jim Burke, Mandy Culpepper, and Drew Coe
Staff--Eliana Camargo, Dave Fowler, and Pete Cafferata
Participants--Steve Baumgartner, Peter Ribar, and Dave Longstreth
Webinar participants (3): Richard Gienger, Stacy Stanish, and Will Olsen

2. Report by the Co-Chairs

- Russ Henly reported on the following topics:
 - Funding for EMC projects: The Department of Finance has approved \$425,000 per year indefinitely for EMC projects. State Assembly and Senate Subcommittees are hearing this budget item on April 25th and 26th. If formally approved, this funding will provide the EMC with greater flexibility to support longer term projects. Projected Timber Regulation and Forest Restoration Fund (TRFR) funds from the lumber and wood products assessment for fiscal year 2017-18 are estimated at \$54 million, compared to \$41 million last fiscal year.
 - The California Forest Carbon Plan remains at the Governor's office waiting public release. The hope is that a final version will be available to the public the week of April 30th.
 - AB 1492 update:
 - Good progress has occurred for CalTREES electronic plan submission development; it is expected to be fully available by October 2018. CAL FIRE will beta test the system with State Forest Exemption and Emergency Notices, followed by THPs.
 - The permitting synchronicity interagency group is working on minimizing the lag time between THP approval and approval for other types of permits (e.g., LSAA, Water Board WDR General Orders).
 - This is the last meeting for EMC Member Tom Engstrom, who is retiring from SPI after 33 years. **EMC members and staff thank Tom for his excellent work on the EMC since its inception in October 2014.**
 - Currently there are 4 vacancies on the EMC: 2 academic seats, 1 wildlife seat, and the SWRCB seat. **The EMC will put out a general notice for the academic and wildlife seats at the same time, looking for resource professionals with strong technical qualifications. Co-Chair Henly will contact Paul Hann at the SWRCB regarding potential candidates for the State Water Board seat.**
- Sue Husari reported on the following topic:
 - EMC Member Greg Giusti and Co-Chair Husari suggest that it might be better to have the EMC meet quarterly, reducing the time and travel commitments of potential members, and helping recruitment for the EMC academic seats. Member O'Connor suggested that web/net meetings could also be utilized, recognizing Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act limitations.

3. Updates on Contracting for Projects Approved by the EMC

- **EMC-2015-001 (Class II-Large Monitoring)**: Matt House confirmed that Oregon State University Master of Science (MS) student Adam Pate is contacting large forest landowners to implement the regional scale component of the Class II large watercourse study, which will be assessing the effectiveness of rule criteria for identifying Class II watercourses susceptible to thermal loading. The field work will occur this summer. CAL FIRE staff provided Mr. Pate with an up-to-date list of large non-federal forest landowners in California, approximate ownership size, and appropriate contacts on March 22nd.
- **EMC-2015-002 [Forest Practice Rules Implementation and Effectiveness Monitoring (FORPRIEM) ver. 2.0.] and EMC-2015-004 (Effectiveness of Road Rules in Reducing Hydrologic Connectivity and Significant Sediment Discharge)—Statistical Consultation**: Pete Cafferata and Drew Coe reported that EMC-funded statistical consultants Dr. Ashley Steel and Pat Cunningham, US Forest Service Pacific Northwest Research Station (PNW), have prepared an updated draft report. Key components include (1) evaluating plan risk using mean slope, deep-seated landslide rating, drainage density, mean annual precipitation, and rock strength; (2) assigning a factor of 1, 2, or 3 for each factor, so that maximum plan score could be 15 and the minimum 5; (3) sampling all plans with a score of 10 or higher, and taking a random sample of plans with a score <10; (4) within a plan, use GIS to create a population of road segments of similar lengths and hillslope gradient with 3 strata—roads with no crossings, roads on hillslopes <40% with crossings, and roads on hillslopes >40% with crossings; (5) selecting one random road segment from each road stratum (if not available—two strata are selected, one from each of the remaining strata, or 2 from the same stratum); (6) using GIS, create a population of all Class I and II watercourse segments that are within 1,320 feet of a road segment and randomly select one segment; and (7) the population of road segments selected for FORPRIEM ver. 2.0. will also serve as the sample of roads for the Roads Rules Effectiveness Monitoring Study. **Dr. Steel will present the final report to the EMC at the June 25th meeting (remote webinar).**
 - Peter Ribar suggested that careful consideration be given to the hillslope gradient percent used for the road segments, since it does not match requirements currently used in the Forest Practice Rules.
 - Will Olsen will beta test the GIS procedures outlined above on 2-3 plans from the original FORPRIEM sample.
- **EMC-2016-003: Repeat LiDAR Surveys to Detect Landslides**: No update was provided.
- **EMC-2017-001 (UC Davis Caspar Creek Nutrient Study)**: Pete Cafferata stated that Dr. Helen Dahlke, UC Davis, informed him that Dr. Randy Dahlgren and MS student Sienna McLaughlin will be providing a PowerPoint presentation on the study at the annual Caspar Creek meeting being held in Fort Bragg on May 9-10, 2018. **Co-Chair Henly requested that Mr. Cafferata invite Dr. Dahlke to present the PowerPoint to the EMC at a future meeting.**
- **EMC-2017-002 (Boggs Mountain Demonstration State Forest (BMDSF) Post-Fire Automated Bird Recorders Study)**: The second year of bird recordings will be made in the late spring of 2018.
- **EMC-2017-004: Monitoring Class III Watercourses**: Equipment for this project has not been purchased by CAL FIRE staff.
- **EMC-2017-006: Tradeoffs Between Riparian Buffers, Fire, and Regeneration**: Eliana Camargo announced that CAL FIRE's Business Services Office (BSO) has sent the contract for this project, submitted by Dr. Rob York, to UC Berkeley for their review and signature.

- **EMC-2017-007: The Life Cycle of Dead Trees and Implications for Management:** Eliana Camargo announced that CAL FIRE's BSO has sent the contract for this project submitted by Dr. John Battles to UC Berkeley for their review and signature.
- **EMC-2017-008: FPRs to Minimize Fir Mortality from Root Diseases:** Eliana Camargo stated that Cal Poly State University is rapidly creating a scope of work and budget so that the EMC funding can be encumbered prior to the end of the fiscal year.
- **EMC-2017-009: Effectiveness of Class II Watercourse and Lake Protection Zone (WLPZ) Forest Practice Rules (FPRs) at Maintaining or Restoring Canopy Closure, Stream Water Temperature, and Primary Productivity:** Matt House reported that he was able to gain NMFS and USFWS concurrence to move ahead with the study during a meeting held 1-2 weeks ago. Green Diamond Resource Company (GDRCo) will host the study to test both FPRs and their aquatic Habitat Conservation Plan prescriptions. Mr. House and Drew Coe will reengage OSU's Drs. Kevin Bladon and Catalina Segura to finalize the study plan, with the expectation of requesting EMC funding in fiscal year 2018.
- **EMC-2017-012: Bat Study on Demonstration State Forests:** Some of the equipment for this project has been purchased. All of the EMC funding has been spent so Michael Baker is now working to spend the Demonstration State Forest portion of the funding.

5. EMC Discussion of Possible Update to EMC Project Review Process

Eliana Camargo produced revised draft templates for EMC Initial Concept Proposals, Full Project Proposals, and Requests for Funding to help improve the project review process. Co-Chair Husari provided the EMC with a list of EMC Project Review Subcommittee recommendations developed by Member Giusti and herself addressing these forms and the general project review process. Using the Subcommittee recommendations as background, the EMC discussed its processes for approving and ranking projects and making funding recommendations. The goal is to develop, for the Board's consideration, a couple of alternative approaches for these processes, including the current process. The alternatives should include a process that more directly involves the Board in project approval in general, and funding allocation decisions in particular. **The Co-chairs will work with Board staff to develop these alternative approaches for discussion at the next EMC meeting. As background for this discussion, Board staff will provide the EMC with examples of how other state agencies conduct grant review processes.**

As part of the discussion, EMC members asked for more information on the context for the EMC's work that is provided by AB 1492. **Board staff will circulate the relevant Public Resources Code sections to the EMC members.**

. For the Initial Concept Proposal, EMC comments included having the Board of Forestry and Fire Protection (BOF) review the initial concept proposals and make recommendations. Additional input on the initial concept proposal form from the EMC included:

- Adding the duration of the project.
- Removing version/draft # from the form.

EMC staff and Co-Chair Henly will develop a revised version of the Initial Concept Proposal for EMC review prior to the next meeting.

For the Full Concept Proposal, the EMC determined that it should include a detailed request for funding/rate sheet (budget) (i.e., there will not be separate forms for the full concept proposal and request for funding). Additional suggested changes for this form included:

- Adding methods/analysis framework.
- Adding deliverables (including progress reports).

EMC staff and Co-Chair Henly will develop a revised version for the Full Concept Proposal form, using complete examples from past EMC funding projects, and provide it to the EMC prior to the next meeting. Both forms are to be made available prior to the next round of expected EMC funding.

Additionally, the EMC Project Review Subcommittee requested that the next version of the EMC Strategic Plan include greater detail on the decision-making process for grants (i.e., what is the role of the EMC, what is the Board's role, and what is the role of Board staff in selection and funding projects). The Subcommittee suggested adding objectives to the Strategic Plan regarding transparency and conflict of interest (i.e., removing the potential for conflict of interest or appearance of conflict of interest in the selection and award of grants). They also suggested including language specifying that projects are only to be requested once a year with specific deadlines for submission (i.e., remove discretion for evaluating projects outside of the defined timeframes).

Co-Chair Husari determined that the revised version of the "Request for Effectiveness Monitoring Project Proposals" document requires substantial revision work. **Eliana Camargo will send out the current revised version to the EMC for suggested revisions to be made with track changes in Word.**

6. Response to BOF Member Mike Miles' Class II-Large Watercourse Questions

Pete Cafferata and Drew Coe provided an overview of a draft document with responses to Board of Forestry and Fire Protection Forest Practice Committee Chair Mike Miles' 9 questions on Class II-Large watercourses. These questions address the necessity and benefit of Class II-L riparian forest prescriptions relative to downstream receiving Class I waters and planned Class II-L effectiveness monitoring studies. In general, there were few literature citations available to directly answer the questions generated by Member Miles, with the exception of #7 (large wood recruitment and channel process/function). Examples of past research, both published and gray literature, that contain pertinent information are provided for each of the questions addressing the transport of watershed products to Class I watercourses (i.e., macroinvertebrates, water with elevated temperature, large wood). Water temperature and macroinvertebrate-related questions #1 and #4 can be addressed with EMC-2017-009: *Effectiveness of Class II Watercourse and Lake Protection Zone (WLPZ) Forest Practice Rules (FPRs) at Maintaining or Restoring Canopy Closure, Stream Water Temperature, and Primary Productivity*. Questions #2 and #5 could be addressed with an expanded version of EMC-2017-009, given sufficient funding. Question #3 is currently being addressed by a study being conducted by HSU MS student Jonathan Hollis on GDRCo forestlands. Due to the long lag times for large wood to enter and move downstream, questions #6-9 can be addressed indirectly with large wood models using data collected in the field as part of EMC-2017-009.

Mr. Cafferata and Mr. Coe will include additional information from the 2008 Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) review and the Anadromous Salmonid Protection (ASP) rule package development process in the next draft of the document. Co-Chair Henly will distribute that draft to the EMC for their

review and comments. BOF staff and Co-Chair Henly will work with Mr. Cafferata and Mr. Coe to produce a final draft that will be submitted to the BOF's Forest Practice Committee (FPC).

7. Public Forum – No public comments.

8. Location and Future EMC Meeting Dates

The next EMC meeting will be held on June 25th in Redding at the Redding Electric Utility Office. Member Chinnici requested that EMC staff consider scheduling a summer field meeting, similar to the field meeting held at the Caspar Creek Experimental Watershed in 2017. Possible sites suggested included the Kings River Experimental Watershed (KREW), Blodgett Forest Research Station, Boggs Mountain Demonstration State Forest, and areas with Exemption or Emergency Notice harvesting (e.g., Sly Park/Jenkinson Lake). Additional ideas for a field meeting can be provided to Co-Chair Henly.

9. Announcements

A symposium titled "Living with Fire in California's Coast Ranges: Promoting Fire-Resilient Communities and Landscapes in an Era of Global Change" will take place on May 7-9, 2018 at Sonoma State University, Rohnert Park. The third day will include multiple field trip possibilities, including BMDSF. See: <http://www.cafiresci.org/events-webinars-source/category/livingwithfirecoastranges>

The Board of Forestry and Fire Protection meeting being held in Santa Rosa on May 8-10 will include a field trip to view multiple aspects of the October North Bay wildfires.

The Western Section of the Wildlife Society is holding a Foothill Yellow-Legged Frog Ecology, Management, and Regulation Workshop on May 31st to June 3rd at Humboldt State University (a total 27 slots were available, space may be very limited). See: https://www.wildlifeprofessional.org/western/fylf2018_reg.php

The Soil Science Society of America Annual Meeting will be in San Diego, January 6-9, 2019, with wildfire as a main theme for the meeting. There will be all-day symposium with oral sessions and poster presentations covering aspects of wildfire effects on soils. See: <https://www.sacmeetings.org/>